

The 1939 College All-Star Games

By John Hogrogian

The first College All-Star Game was played in Chicago on August 31, 1934. The last was played on July 23, 1976. The annual pre-season meeting between the previous year's NFL champions and a team of just-graduated college stars was a popular attraction for most of its 43-year run.

Older fans and football historians still remember the annual Chicago game. Almost completely forgotten is that other cities also hosted pre-season college all-star games before World War II. In 1939, there were eight such contests. The Chicago game was the biggest, but games in New York and Dallas drew large crowds and media attention. Less prominent games were played in Philadelphia, Cleveland, St. Louis, Boston, and Providence. The first game was played on August 22, the last on September 15. This article takes a quick look at all eight 1939 college all-star games, focusing on the rosters of the All-Star teams.

The Philadelphia Game

The first game of the season took place at Temple Stadium in Philadelphia on Tuesday night, August 22, 1939. The Philadelphia Inquirer sponsored the game for the third straight year. The Eagles faced a collection of 1939 college grads culled mostly from Eastern schools. Tad Weiman of Princeton and Glen Killingler of West Chester State Teachers College coached the collegians.

The college squad consisted of thirty players, only two of whom had made a major wire-service All-America team. The Philadelphia game was a lesser star in the college all-star constellation.

name	pos	college/1938 A-A	1939 team
Larry Atwell	b	Brown	
Alex Barantovich	e	Penn State	Brooklyn Eagles (AA)
Paul Berezney	t	Fordham	Kenosha Cardinals (AFL)
Oscar Burford	e	Auburn	
Ray Carnely	b	Carnegie	Brooklyn Dodgers
Howard Casey	c	Princeton	
Bill Corey	c	Columbia	
Bill Critchfield	t	Duquesne	
Don Daughters	e	Harvard	
Joe Delaney	t	Holy Cross	
Walt Ehmling	b	Drexel	
Joe Franks	t	Georgetown	Washington Presidents (DL)
Fella Gintoff	b	Boston College	Providence Steamrollers (AA)
Dean Hanley	t	Penn State	
Harry Harrison	b	Penn State	
Brud Holland	e	Cornell/ AP1,UP2	
Ed Kress	b	Lebanon Valley	Wilmington Clippers (AA)
Matt Kuber	g	Villanova	
Al Leeson	g	Pittsburgh	

Kurt Mandrodt	g	Bucknell	Paterson Panthers (AA)
Frank Merka	b	Geo. Washington	
Bob O'Mara	b	Duke	
Ed Palumbo	b	Detroit	
Sam Roeder	b	Franklin & Marshall	
John Siegal	e	Columbia	Chicago Bears
Allan Sturges	t	Temple	
Lou Tomasetti	b	Bucknell	Pittsburgh Pirates
Dick Wehler	c	Temple	
Babe Wood	b	Tennessee	
Greg Zitrides	g	Dartmouth/UP3	

The most interesting aspect of the Eagles' training camp was the travel itinerary of Davey O'Brien, the 1938 Heisman Trophy winner whom the Eagles had signed to a lucrative contract. The Inquirer commented favorably on O'Brien's performance in the early weeks of camp. On Friday, August 11, he completed ten of fifteen passes in an intra-squad game. That evening, he flew to Chicago to join the collegiate squad for the famous Chicago game to be held in Soldier Field on August 30. O'Brien flew back to Philadelphia on Sunday, August 20, two days before the Eagles faced the All-Stars.

On Tuesday, August 22, under the floodlights at Temple Stadium, 25,000 fans watched the Eagles beat the All-Stars 17-0. After three quarters, the Eagles held a slim 3-0 lead. Bad pass protection and receiving rendered the Eagle passing attack utterly futile. In the final quarter, however, the Eagles broke loose for two touchdowns. One drive moved forward on power runs by Dave Smukler and culminated in a short end run by O'Brien into the end zone. The other score came on a short run by Joe Bukant after the Eagles intercepted an All-Star lateral near midfield and returned it to the one yard line.

The Inquirer praised O'Brien's running and kick returning. As a passer, however, O'Brien threw nine passes, completed none, and had three passes intercepted. He would improve as a passer as the season progressed.

The Chicago Game

The Chicago game was the big show. This was the sixth annual pre-season extravaganza, sponsored by The Chicago Tribune, to be held on August 30 in Soldier Field. The defending NFL champions (this year, the New York Giants) faced an All-Star team chosen from graduates of schools across the country. Fans voted for and selected a starting eleven, casting about eleven million votes through a network of 335 newspapers and radio stations in forty-seven states and the District of Columbia. The voting ended in mid-July with Texas Christian quarterback Davey O'Brien the top

THE COFFIN CORNER: Vol. 25, No. 5 (2003)

vote-getter (1,264,516). The Tribune chose fifty-nine substitutes to complete a seventy-player squad.

Both teams opened their training camp on August 12, the Giants in Superior, WI, and the All-Stars on the campus of Northwestern University in Chicago. Fan ballots also chose the All-Star coaching staff. Elmer Layden of Notre Dame was head coach, and his assistants were Harry Stuhldreher of Wisconsin, Carl Snavely of Cornell, Bob Neyland of Tennessee, and Ed Madigan of St. Mary's (of California). They went about turning the seventy players into a team in three weeks. Twenty-eight of the players would not even get into the game. None of the seventy players had played for the collegians in the Philadelphia All-Star game.

In the following table, * indicates an elected starter, while @ indicates that a player did not get into the game.

name	pos	college/1938 A-A	1939 team
Ki Aldrich	c	TCU/AP1,UP1,INS2	Chicago Cardinals
Dave Anderson@	b	California	
Frank Balasz@	b	Iowa	Green Bay Packers
Joe Beinor	t	Notre D./AP1,UP1,INS1	St.Louis Gunners(AFL)
Horace Bell	g	Minnesota	
Ed Bock	g	Iowa St./AP1,UP3,INS2	
Barrett Booth@	b	Louisiana State	
Vic Bottari	b	California/AP2,UP3,INS2	
Charlie Brock*	c	Nebraska/UP3	Green Bay Packers
Earl Brown*	e	Notre Dame/AP2,UP3	
Warren Brunner	b	Tulane/AP3	
Larry Buhler	b	Minnesota	Green Bay Packers
Robert Castelo@	e	Illinois	
Tony Calvelli@	c	Stanford	Detroit Lions
Jim Coughlan	e	Santa Clara	
Bill Daddio	e	Pittsburgh/AP3,UP1	
Jerry Dowd@	c	St. Mary's	Cleveland Rams
George Faust	b	Minnesota	Chicago Cardinals
Pete Fay@	b	Stanford	
Marshall Goldberg*	b	Pittsburgh/AP1,UP1,INS1	Chicago Cardinals
Charles Gross@	g	Bradley	
Bob Haak*	t	Indiana	Brooklyn Dodgers
I.B. Hale	t	Texas Christian/AP2	
Parker Hall@	b	Mississippi/AP1,UP1	Cleveland Rams
Ralph Heikkinen*	g	Michigan/AP1,UP1,INS1	Brooklyn Dodgers
Dan Hill	c	Duke/AP2,UP2,INS1	
Bill Hofer	b	Notre Dame	
Lynn Hovland	g	Wisconsin	
Paul Humphrey	c	Purdue	Brooklyn Dodgers
Tony Ippolito@	b	Purdue	
Harry Jacunski	e	Fordham/INS2	Green Bay Packers
Fred Janke@	t	Michigan	
Bernard Jefferson	b	Northwestern	
Jim Johnston@	b	Washington	Washington Redskins
Mike Kabealo@	b	Ohio State	
Everett Kischer@	b	Iowa State	
Mike Kochel	g	Fordham	Chicago Cardinals
Leon Larson@	e	River Falls	
George Lenc@	e	Augustana	Brooklyn Dodgers
Ed Longhi@	c	Notre Dame	Danbury Trojans (AA)
Sid Luckman	b	Columbia/ AP2	Chicago Bears
Bob MacLeod*	b	Dartmouth/ AP3,UP2,INS1	Chicago Bears
Pug Manders	e	Drake	Brooklyn Dodgers
Jim McDonald@	c	Illinois	
Jim McGoldrick@	g	Notre Dame/ UP2	
Joe Mihal*	t	Purdue/ INS2	
Davey O'Brien*	b	TCU/ AP1,UP1,INS1	Philadelphia Eagles

Vince Oliver@	b	Indiana	E.Chicago Indians (AFL)
Bill Osmanski	b	Holy Cross/UP3,INS2	Chicago Bears
Ted Panish@	b	Bradley	
Billy Patterson	b	Baylor/AP2	Chicago Bears
Bill Paulman@	b	Stanford	
Frank Petrick@	e	Indiana	
Johnny Pingel	b	Michigan State/AP1	Detroit Lions
Alex Schoenbaum	t	Ohio State	
Gerry Seidel	b	Columbia	
Solly Sherman	b	Chicago	Chicago Bears
Don Siegel@	t	Michigan	
Bronko Smlanich@	b	Arizona	Cleveland Rams
Mario Tonelli@	b	Notre Dame	Prov.Steamrollers (AA)
Francis Twedell*	g	Minnesota/AP2,INS1	Green Bay Packers
Robert Tyrrell@	g	St. Ambrose	
Al Van Ranst@	c	Cornell	
Bob Voights	t	Northwestern/UP2	
Howie Weiss*	b	Wisconsin/AP3,UP2,INS1	Detroit Lions
Don Wemple	e	Colgate	
Alvord Wolff	t	Santa Clara/AP1,UP1,INS1	
Bowden Wyatt*	e	Tennessee/AP2,UP2,INS1	
Jake Wysocki	e	Villanova/UP1	
Waddy Young	e	Oklahoma/AP1,UP3,INS1	Brooklyn Dodgers

On Wednesday evening, August 31, the weather was clear and cool in Soldier Field. A crowd of 81,456 fans witnessed the Giants beat the All-Stars 9-0. Both NBC and the Mutual network broadcast the game nationally. Neither team scored a touchdown, but the Giants won on three field goals (Ward Cuff in the first quarter, Ken Strong in the second and fourth). Only in the final quarter did the All-Stars make any headway on offense. For the collegians, Billy Patterson was the best passer, Bill Osmanski the best runner and linebacker, and Ed Bock and Horace Bell the best linemen.

The Dallas Game

The fourth annual Dallas game took place in the Cotton Bowl on September 4, Labor Day night, five days after the Chicago game. Dallas would not yet have an NFL team of its own for over a decade. The format of this game pitted a College All-Star squad primarily from Texas colleges against an invited NFL team, this year the Green Bay Packers. Remarkably, the College All-Stars had won all three previous games. The collegians beat the Chicago Bears 7-6 in 1936 and 6-0 in 1937 and the Washington Redskins 13-7 in 1938.

The co-coaches of the All-Stars were Dutch Meyer of Texas Christian and Marty Bell of Southern Methodist. They opened camp on August 23, a little less than two weeks before the game. The squad of thirty players reported in waves. Nineteen players showed up on opening day. On August 30, Dick Todd reported on leave from Washington Redskins training camp. One day later, Billy Patterson, I.B. Hale, Ed Bock, Jim McDonald, and Fred Janke reported from the All-Star squad that had lost to the Giants in Chicago. One day later, Pete Fay reported from the Chicago All-Star team and Sam Boyd arrived on leave from Pittsburgh Pirates training camp. On Saturday, Ki Aldrich reported from Chicago Cardinals training camp after having played in the Chicago All-Star game. Davey O'Brien and Allie White showed up on Sunday from Philadelphia Eagles training camp. O'Brien had played for the Eagles in the Philadelphia All-Star game and for the All-Stars in the Chicago All-Star game.

THE COFFIN CORNER: Vol. 25, No. 5 (2003)

In the following roster, * indicates that the player had been on the All-Star squad in the Chicago game.

name	pos	college/1938 A-A	1939 team
Ki Aldrich*	c	Texas Christian/AP1,UP1,INS2	Chicago Cardinals
Ed Bock*	g	Iowa State/AP1,UP3,INS2	
Sam Boyd	e	Baylor/AP3	Pittsburgh Pirates
Pat Clifford	b	Texas Christian	
Bill Dewell	e	Southern Methodist	
Pete Fay*	b	Stanford	
Paul Graham	b	Indiana	
George Griggs	g	East Texas State	
I.B. Hale*	t	Texas Christian/AP2	
Johnny Hall	b	Texas Christian	
Clarence Headsteam	b	Hardin-Simmons	
Jess Hines	t	Rice	
Gene Hodge	e	East Texas State	LA Bulldogs (AFL)
Fred Janke*	t	Michigan	
L.W. Killian	c	North Texas State	
Cliff Mathews	g	Southern Methodist	
Jim McDonald*	c	Illinois	
Abe Murphy	t	Texas Tech	
Davey O'Brien*	b	Texas Christian/AP1,UP1,INS1	Phila. Eagles
Billy Patterson*	b	Baylor/ AP2	Chicago Bears
Jack Rhodes	g	Texas	
Owens Rogers	b	Texas A&M	
George Sanders	g	Southern Methodist	
Bruno Schroeder	e	Texas A&M	
Elmer Tarbox	b	Texas Tech	
Dick Todd	b	Texas A&M	Wash. Redskins
Allie White	t	Texas Christian	Phila. Eagles
John Widaman	e	Indiana	
Ward Wilkinson	b	Texas Christian	
Walter Williams	e	Rice	

The Milwaukee Journal described the gamenight weather as "oppressive heat." The audience of about 20,000 fans saw the Packers take a commanding 31-6 lead at halftime. Clarke Hinkle, Don Hutson, Ed Jankowski, and Joe Laws scored first-half touchdowns for the Packers, Pete Fay for the All-Stars. The third quarter was scoreless. In the final quarter, the All-Stars scored twice to make the final score a respectable 31-20. Early in that period, O'Brien threw a short touchdown pass to Bill Dewell. A good punt return by O'Brien launched another successful drive late in the game, culminating in a touchdown pass from O'Brien to Todd. O'Brien threw 20 passes for 11 completions and 127 yards.

Two members of the All-Star team would join the Chicago Cardinals in 1940. The Dallas Morning News noted that Bill Dewell of Southern Methodist "has rejected offers to play pro football." The News reported that Dewell "will attend school at SMU this fall, finishing work for his degree, and will serve as an assistant on Matty Bell's coaching staff." Johnny Hall of Texas Christian would join Dewell on the 1940 Cardinals, but The News gave no hint of his plans for the autumn of 1939.

The Cleveland Game

This was a decidedly local affair. The Rams faced an All-Star squad selected from 1939 graduates of Ohio colleges plus graduates of other colleges who were Ohio natives. Fans chose the collegian squad through voting conducted by newspapers

throughout Ohio. The Cleveland Press and the American Legion sponsored the game. In the debut contest in 1938, the Rams had beaten the All-Stars 10-7.

The Rams opened their training camp in Berea on August 14. The All-Stars convened at John Carroll College on August 23. Ray Ride of Case College directed the All-Stars, assisted by Bill Edwards of Western Reserve, Ray Watts of Baldwin-Wallace, and Tom Conley of John Carroll. When the All-Stars assembled on August 23, six pro rookies left the Rams camp (with permission) and joined the All-Stars: John Wilson, Mike Rodak, and Al Litwak of Western Reserve, Chet Adams of Ohio University, Tom Manning of Dayton, and J.B. Russell of Marshall. On September 1, both teams received an infusion of talent from the collegian squad of the Chicago game. Parker Hall, Bruno Smilanich, and Jerry Dowd reported to the Rams, while Alex Schoenbaum and Frank Petrick joined the All-Stars.

None of the thirty-seven All-Stars had made a major wire-service All-American team in 1938.

name	pos	college/1938 A-A	1939 team
Chet Adams	t	Ohio University	Cleveland Rams
Joe Aleskus	t	Ohio State	Columbus Bullies (AFL)
Bill Bullock	b	Ohio State	
Harry Campbell	t	Capital	
Ray Chenek	g	Ohio University	
Dick Domanski	t	John Carroll	
Carmen Falzone	b	Kent State	
Vince Fiordalis	g	Case	
Pete Gales	g	Ohio University	Columbus Bullies (AFL)
Clarence Goldsmith	b	Baldwin-Wallace	
Hank Green	e	Marshall	
Dave Henderson	b	Wooster	
Joe Hctor	b	John Carroll	
Matt Ivary	c	Ohio University	
Stan Iwucz	g	Ohio University	
Walter Kominic	b	Akron	
Al Litwak	b	Western Reserve	
Vic Malinovsky	c	Ohio Wesleyan	
Tom Manning	c	Dayton	
Clarence Marcks	b	Ohio University	Dayton Bombers (AFL)
Chuck Metzger	b	Miami	
John Montgomery	b	Ohio University	
Frank Petrick	e	Indiana	
Mike Rodak	b	Western Reserve	Cleveland Rams
J.B. Russell	e	Marshall	Cincinnati Bengals (AFL)
Andy Saxon	t	Western Reserve	
Al Schmerge	g	Xavier	
Alex Schoenbaum	t	Ohio State	
Harry Shelby	g	Cincinnati	Cincinnati Bengals (AFL)
Floyd Storey	t	Baldwin-Wallace	
Ernie Sullivan	e	Kent State	
Gabe Szabo	e		Miami
Herb Trattner	g	Ohio Northern	
Paul Wilcox	e		Ohio University
Jerry Williams	b	Miami	
Johnny Wilson	e	Western Reserve	Cleveland Rams
Zeno Zarachowicz	b	John Carroll	

On Wednesday evening, September 6, a paid attendance of 21,442 fans watched the Rams beat the All-Stars 28-0 in Cleveland Stadium. The Rams led 7-0 at halftime, then trounced the All-Stars in the second half. Corby Davis scored two touchdowns for the

THE COFFIN CORNER: Vol. 25, No. 5 (2003)

Rams, while Johnny Drake and Bill McRaven scored one apiece. Parker Hall impressed with his passing and running in the second half. The Rams made a total of sixteen first downs, the All-Stars three. The Rams gained 311 yards from scrimmage, the All-Stars 68.

After the game, the Rams invited Chet Adams, Mike Rodak, and John Wilson back into camp. Tom Manning, J.B. Russell, and Al Litwak were cut without ever rejoining the Rams.

The New York Game

The New York game was the biggest pre-season event outside of the Chicago game. This was the fourth annual game, sponsored by The New York Herald Tribune, with the proceeds to go to the paper's Fresh Air Fund. The format pitted the New York Giants against the Eastern College All-Stars. The Giants had won all three of the previous games. The contest was scheduled for Thursday night, September 7, at the Polo Grounds.

Jock Sutherland coached the All-Stars. He had resigned after the 1938 season from the head coaching job at Pittsburgh, a perennial football powerhouse. His resignation followed the school's decision to de-emphasize its football program. He opened his training camp on August 20 at the New York Military Academy at Cornwall, up the Hudson River from New York City. He had nineteen players in camp for the first two days, but the squad then shrank to eighteen when Sid Luckman departed to join the All-Star team preparing for the Chicago game.

On August 23, five players arrived in Cornwall after having played for the All-Stars in the Philadelphia game. On that same day, Harold Stebbins of Pitt reported after finishing summer classes, bringing the roster up to 24 players. On August 30, eight more players (including Sid Luckman) arrived in camp after being on the All-Star game in Chicago. The New York Times published a charming photograph of these eight players (together with assistant coach John Michelosen and a TWA flight attendant) standing beside their chartered plane at Newark Airport. This infusion of talent from Chicago brought the All-Stars up to their full compliment of 32 players.

In the following roster, * indicates that the player was on the All-Star squad Philadelphia, @ in Chicago.

name	pos	college/1938 A-A	1939 team
Paul Berezney*	t	Fordham	Kenosha Cardinals (AFL)
Don Campbell	t	Carnegie Tech	Pittsburgh Pirates
Ray Carnelly*	b	Carnegie Tech	Brooklyn Dodgers
John Chickeneo	b	Pittsburgh	
Bill Daddio@	e	Pittsburgh/AP3,UP1	
Bob Dannies	c	Pittsburgh	
Bill Dorsey	e	Manhattan	
Bob Gibson	c	Dartmouth	
Marshall Goldberg@	b	Pittsburgh/AP1,UP1,INS1	Chicago Cardinals
Shine Hall	b	Brown	Jersey City Giants (AA)
Fabian Hoffman	e	Pittsburgh	
Brud Holland*	e	Cornell/UP2	
Harry Jacunski@	e	Fordham/INS2	Green Bay Packers
Mike Kochel@	g	Fordham	Chicago Cardinals
George Larkowich	t	Brown	
Jack Lee	b	Carnegie Tech	Pittsburgh Pirates

Al Leeson*	g	Pittsburgh	
Sid Luckman@	b	Columbia/AP2	Chicago Bears
Bob MacLeod@	b	Dartmouth/AP3,UP2,INS1	Chicago Bears
Elmer Merkovsky	t	Pittsburgh	
Bill Osmanski@	b	Holy Cross/ UP3,INS2	Chicago Bears
Steve Petro	g	Pittsburgh	
Walter Raskowski	g	Pittsburgh	
Sid Roth	g	Cornell/AP2	
Pete Shulha	g	Manhattan	Union City Rams (AA)
Wilmeth Sidat-Singh	b	Syracuse	
John Siegal*	e	Columbia	Chicago Bears
Harold Stebbins	b	Pittsburgh	
Phil Swiadon	t	New York Univ	Union City Rams (AA)
Bob Taylor	b	Columbia	Jersey City Giants (AA)
Al Van Ranst@	c	Cornell	
Cliff Wilson	b	Harvard	

On Thursday night, September 7, a crowd of 38,667 fans assembled under the floodlights in the Polo Grounds. The New York Times described the player introductions:

The Giants were introduced first, a brilliant spotlight beam lighting the path for each player to his position on the darkened field. The pro champions were clad in their familiar red jerseys and dun-colored pants. Then came the All-Stars, resplendent in gold pants and helmets and white jerseys, appropriately modeled after Pittsburgh's battle regalia.

The Giants won the game 10-0. The Giants scored in the second quarter on a nine-yard touchdown pass from Tuffy Leemans to Chuck Gelatka. In the third quarter, Ken Strong kicked a 26-yard field goal. The All-Stars twice drove past the New York 20 yard line, but both drives ended with intercepted passes. Bob MacLeod of the All-Stars made the longest run of the game, a 37-yard dash in the second quarter.

The St. Louis Game

The All-Star game concept spread beyond the NFL. In 1938, the Chicago Cardinals had beaten an All-Star team 32-0 in St. Louis, not then an NFL city. This year, the American Legion post in St. Louis sponsored a game between the AFL's St. Louis Gunners and an All-Star squad drawn from midwestern schools. The game was set for Friday night, September 8, at Walsh Stadium, home of the Billikens of St. Louis University and of the Gunners themselves. The Gunners had compiled a record of 4-3-1 in 1938 and opened their 1939 training camp on August 14 at Excelsior Springs in southern Missouri. Their rookie tailback was Tommy Thompson from Tulsa, well known for his passing; he would eventually have a good career in the NFL.

The All-Stars opened camp on about August 24 at Walsh Stadium. The coaches were Jimmy Conzelman of Washington University and Cecil Muellerleile of St. Louis University, the two leading local schools. They took charge of a squad of 29 players, seven of whom were part of the All-Star squad in the Chicago game on August 30. I have not been able to identify one of the players, a halfback named Adams. In the following roster, * indicates that the player was part of the All-Star squad in Chicago.

name	pos	college/1938 A-A	1939 team
------	-----	------------------	-----------

THE COFFIN CORNER: Vol. 25, No. 5 (2003)

? Adams	b ?	
Stony Barber	t Oklahoma City Univ	
George Bazik	b Iowa State	
Joe Beinor*	t Notre Dame/AP1,UP1,INS1	St.L Gunners (AFL)
Merlyn Burris	b Illinois	
Denny Cochran	b St. Louis Univ	St. Louis Gunners (AFL)
Miles Cunningham	t Washington (Mo.)	
Jack Dodd	b Nebraska	St. Louis Gunners (AFL)
Fred Doerner	t McKendree	
Dave Ewalt	g Macomb Teachers	
Frank Gatski	t W. Va. Wesleyan	
Frank Gayer	e St. Louis Univ	
Bill Hofer*	b Notre Dame	
Tony Ippolito*	b Purdue	
George Johnson	g St. Louis Univ	
Bob Kellogg	t Kansas	
Everett Kischer*	b Iowa State	
Nick Klisurich	c Washington (Mo.)	
Jim McGoldrick*	g Notre Dame/UP2	
Gail McWard	g Illinois College	
Vince Oliver*	b Indiana	E.Chicago Indians (AFL)
Terry Patrick	b Arkansas Teachers	
Les Pieper	e Missouri	St. Louis Gunners (AFL)
Bob Scudder	c Colorado	St. Louis Gunners (AFL)
Mario Tonelli*	b Notre Dame	Prov.Steamrollers (AA)
Hal Tracy	e Washington (Mo.)	
Argyle Wakeman	e Warrensburg Teachers	
Bob Wehrli	b Illinois	
Jim Wilson	e Missouri Mines	

On September 8, hot weather gripped St. Louis. The St. Louis Post-Dispatch reported that "spectators in shirt-sleeves perspired through the long, drawn-out evening of too many penalties and wondered how those players could endure out there on that steaming gridiron, garbed as they were in the heavy accoutrements of football battle." The crowd of 8,212 spectators saw the All-Stars embarrass the Gunners 21-13. Late in the first quarter, All-Star Jack Dodd ran 52 yards to the Gunners' 13-yard line. Two plays later, Denny Cochran carried the ball into the end zone. Late in the second quarter, All-Star Everett Kischer intercepted a Gunner pass and returned it sixty yards for another touchdown. Two minutes into the third quarter, Mario Tonelli ran 65 yards for the third All-Star touchdown. Trailing 21-0, the Gunners scored touchdowns on short runs by Ray Johnson and Keith Elder. They could not, however, catch up.

Joe Beinor, a 1938 All-American tackle at Notre Dame, played well despite joining the All-Star squad only on the day of the game. According to The Post-Dispatch, "arriving shortly before the contest, the Notre Dame tackle had no chance to learn signals and had to find out in each huddle what was going to happen." Beinor and four of his All-Star teammates played for the Gunners during the 1939 season.

The Boston Game

The local American Legion post sponsored the third annual Boston All-Star game. In 1937 and 1938, an All-Star team beat the Boston Shamrocks, a member of the AFL in 1937 and an independent pro team in 1938. This year, with the Shamrocks defunct, the American Legion secured the Washington Redskins (Boston's NFL representative through 1936) to face the Eastern All-Stars in Fenway Park on Monday night, September 11.

The Redskins had been training on the West Coast and had beaten the Los Angeles Bulldogs 21-0 on September 4. Former Harvard assistant coach Swede Nelson had his team together for only three days. The squad of 23 players gathered and practiced twice in Fenway Park on the weekend before the game. Sixteen of the players had played in the New York All-Star game on Thursday, September 7. Half of the 32-man New York squad headed to Boston, but among the missing were stars Sid Luckman, Bill Osmanski, and Marshall Goldberg, all of whom had reported to their NFL teams. Nelson also had four players who had last played in the Philadelphia All-Star game and three players who had last played in the Chicago game. Each of the 23 players in the Boston game had played in a previous All-Star game. In the following roster, * indicates that the player had played in the New York game, % in the Philadelphia game, and # in the Chicago game.

name	pos	college/1938 A-A	1939 team
Paul Berezney%*	t	Fordham	Kenosha Cardinals (AFL)
Howard Casey%	c	Princeton	
John Chickerno*	b	Pittsburgh	
Don Daughters%	e	Harvard	
Bill Dorsey*	e	Manhattan	Newark Bears (AA)
Bob Gibson*	c	Dartmouth	
Fella Gintoff%	b	Boston College	Prov.Steamrollers (AA)
Shine Hall*	b	Brown	Jersey City Giants (AA)
Fabian Hoffman*	e	Pittsburgh	
Brud Holland%*	e	Cornell/UP2	
Mike Kochel#*	g	Fordham	Chicago Cardinals
Bob MacLeod#*	b	Dartmouth/AP3,UP2,INS1	Chicago Bears
Elmer Merkovsky*	t	Pittsburgh	
Bob O'Mara%	b	Duke	
Steve Petro*	g	Pittsburgh	
Walter Raskowski*	g	Pittsburgh	
Sid Roth*	g	Cornell/AP2	
Gerry Seidel#	b	Columbia	
Wilmet Sidat-Singh*	b	Syracuse	
Don Siegel#	t	Michigan	
Bob Taylor*	b	Columbia	Jersey City Giants (AA)
Al Van Ranst#*	t	Cornell	
Don Wempel#	e	Colgate	

On Sunday, September 10, the 1939 NFL regular season began. The Detroit Lions beat the Chicago Cardinals 21-13. That was the only game of the day. Before the following Friday was over, two more regular season games and two more College All-Star games would be played.

On Monday night, September 11, a large crowd of 25,000 paid their way into Fenway Park for the game. The Boston Herald reported that "two lineups of All-Stars and the starting Redskins team were introduced by announcer Frank Ryan before the game. As each player trotted onto the field under a spotlight, an aerial bomb was set off." Because the All-Stars had only 23 players, free substitution was allowed.

Five minutes into the game, the All-Stars capped a seven-play drive with a five-yard touchdown run by Bob MacLeod. The All-Stars missed the extra point. Early in the second quarter, Frank Filchock threw an eleven-yard touchdown pass to Bob McChesney. The Redskins quickly took a 14-6 lead on a short touchdown run by Andy Farkas. Just before halftime, MacLeod threw a 39-yard

THE COFFIN CORNER: Vol. 25, No. 5 (2003)

touchdown pass to Fabian Hoffman to make the score 14-13 in favor of the Redskins.

In the third quarter, the Redskins twice drove to touchdowns, with Filchok and Wilbur Moore scoring on short runs. At the start of the fourth quarter, Washington coach Ray Flaherty sent Sammy Baugh into action for the first time. Baugh had sat out the game until then because of a "bad cold." Baugh's passes brought the Skins downfield and led to a 27-yard field goal by Bo Russell. Trailing 30-13, the All-Stars scored two touchdowns in the final three minutes on passes from MacLeod to Bill Dorsey for 17 yards and from Wilmeth Sidat-Singh to MacLeod for 45 yards. The Redskins won the game 30-27. Six days later, the Redskins opened their NFL schedule with a 7-0 victory over the Philadelphia Eagles.

The Providence Game

The last of the eight College All-Star games came on Friday night, September 15, when the New York Giants met the Eastern All-Stars in the high school stadium in Cranston, a small city close to Providence, Rhode Island. This was the second annual charity game, sponsored by the local Shriners. Last year, the Chicago Bears had come to town to beat the All-Stars 24-16.

The famous Jock Sutherland coached the All-Stars. He arrived by train in Providence on September 8, the day after his Eastern All-Stars had lost to the New York Giants in the Polo Grounds. He didn't have many players to train at first, with 17 of his 25 players in Boston for that City's All-Star game. Of those 17 players, 10 had played for Dr. Sutherland in the New York game. On Monday night, September 11, the Washington Redskins beat the All-Stars in Fenway Park. On Tuesday, Sutherland had a full squad in attendance at Narragansett Pier, a resort area in the southern part of Rhode Island. The players trained for three days, culminating in a scrimmage on Thursday night on the campus of Rhode Island State College, now known as the University of Rhode Island.

In the roster that follows, * indicates that the player had played in the New York game, % in the Philadelphia game, # in the Chicago game, @ in the Boston game, \$ in the Cleveland game, and + in the St. Louis game.

name	pos	college/1938 A-A	1939 team
Paul Berezney%*@	t	Fordham	Kenosha Cardinals (AFL)
Howard Casey%@	c	Princeton	
John Chickerneo*@	b	Pittsburgh	
Don Daughters%@	e	Harvard	
Marvin Franklin	e	Vanderbilt	Prov.Steamrollers (AA)
Bob Gibson*@	c	Dartmouth	
Fella Gintoff%@	b	Boston College	Prov.Steamrollers (AA)
Shine Hall*@	b	Brown	Jersey City Giants (AA)
Matt Kuber%	g	Villanova	
Bob MacLeod#*@	b	Dartmouth/AP3,UP2,INS1	Chicago Bears
Elmer Merkovsky*@	t	Pittsburgh	
Vince Oliver#+	b	Indiana	East Chi. Indians (AFL)
Bob O'Mara%@	b	Duke	
Ed Palumbo%	b	Detroit	
Frank Petrick#\$	e	Indiana	
Steve Petro*@	g	Pittsburgh	
Walter Raskowski*@	g	Pittsburgh	
Alex Schoenbaum#\$	t	Ohio State	

Gerry Seidel#@	b	Columbia	
Wilmeth Sidat-Singh*@	b	Syracuse	
Don Siegel#@	t	Michigan	
Mario Tonelli#+	b	Notre Dame	Provi.Steamrollers (AA)
Al Van Ranst#*@	t	Cornell	
Don Wempel#@	e	Colgate	
Greg Zitrides%	g	Dartmouth/UP3	

Only Marvin Franklin had not played in an earlier All-Star game.

On Friday night, 10,000 fans saw the Giants trample the All-Stars 31-0. The All-Stars made little headway against the NFL's leading defense; they twice drove to within the New York 5 yard line, only to lose the ball on downs. On offense, the Giants scored four touchdowns (Burnett, Leemans, Walls, Soar) and a field goal (Strong). Jock Sutherland's coaching genius could not turn this collection of good college players into a unit strong enough to challenge the defending NFL champions.

In its pre-game reporting, The Providence Journal discussed the future plans of Bob MacLeod, the All-American halfback from Dartmouth. "The Shrine game will be MacLeod's final football encounter for he will board a plane for the Pacific Coast immediately following the game to take a position there. He will not play professional football." The Journal was wrong. The Brooklyn Dodgers had selected MacLeod with the fifth pick in the first round of the 1939 college draft. MacLeod could not come to terms with the Dodgers. On September 28, the Dodgers sent their rights to negotiate with MacLeod to the Bears in exchange for the contract of third-year back Ray Buivid. While Buivid never reported to Brooklyn, MacLeod immediately signed with the Bears. He played the 1939 season, then indeed withdrew from professional football.